

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

Parramatta Jan^y 22^d 1822

Rev^d Sir/

On Wednesday the 16th I wrote you a second Letter on the Subject of yours to me on the 8th and just as I was putting the waifer in you came into M^r Campbell's office accompanied by M^r Cowell, when I immediately handed you my Letter, which you then read and told me you would give me no answer to it –

[The Letter accompanied these papers]BNot done BC

I told M^r Marsden I would stand by what I had written.]

As this rested with yourself I had no more to say at that time upon the Subject –

As you have, after making your Charges, declined to support them, I feel myself

[I offered him to come forward and at P[ort] J[ackson] and prove them this I did . .

.]

called upon to make a few observations upon them by way of reply – In the first Place you charge me with defamation – you observe “when you returned from New Zealand you immediately began to speak evil of me and mine.” In answer to this Charge I beg to say that when I returned to New South Wales, many of our Friends^x were anxious to learn the State of the Mission and also how every individual felt in their new Station –

^x [There are many friends to the Mission; but many of them have said to me that M^r Marsden hinders them forw^d by the way in which he acts.]

I satisfied their Inquiries as far as I could in general Conversation, without the

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

most distant Intention of injuring any one in the Mission – my most ardent wish was that all might be happy & prosper in their work – with respect to yourself I thought you were too violent with the natives,

[Shamefully wrong the whole of the natives will testify of my kindness toward them]

and I feared this would be productive of evil and not good – I was also sorry that Mrs Butler was not more reconciled to her Situation.^x

[For a good reason, Mrs B was dissatisfied: Mr Marsden made her wretched see my journal]

She had come out against her will and therefore she was to be pitied, as that would always make her unhappy – No Person should be forced into such a work; if they [f] are they cannot be happy. Mrs Butler repeatedly told me she never wished to come – and on that Ground she has Cause to complain, and demands commiseration –

[But he cares not for it.]

her difficulties would be much lighter if her mind was at ease – I never charged Mrs Butler with neglect of duty – I know she is a woman that cannot be idle, and has slaved very hard –

He allows Mrs Butler to work very hard. Wonderful]

If this is speaking evil of you and yours I have done so. I have never accused you of neglect to Labour; for I have always said you have laboured hard – As for me

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

charging you with neglect of duty, I do not understand exactly what you mean. The Term duty is used in too general a way – If you had mentioned to what part of your Conduct you applied the Term I should have known what reply to have made – As a “magistrate of the British Realm” I can know nothing of you – Here I think you mistake the extent of your Authority – as you could not act even in New South Wales in that Capacity – Your Magisterial Authority was merely local –
[by his wish I became a Magistrate yet this is right]

You observe “since you have taken upon you to traduce my Character without any just Cause; you must hereafter stand prepared to justify your own.” I do not see the Force of this Argument – One man may accuse another, and yet the Accuser may have done no wrong – You accuse me of selling the things which you say you wrote for – The Articles you allude to were not your Property, but the Society’s –
[But I expected to have a portion of them for my family’s use as I wrote for them.]

They were not consigned to you, but to me as the Society’s Agent – If you mean to insinuate that I derived any advantage from the Sale of these Goods, you are mistaken – You know better – and you know why I directed them to be sold –
[The goods which I applied for were, I apprehend the only goods for sale and there was an invoice of them] \ because there were no Invoices of the prices of the different Articles but only [f] the Sum total – without I had known the Prices

[The goods were not for sale I believe, but for the natives]

of each separate Article I would never venture to send them to New Zealand; for if

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

I had made a mistake, and overcharged a Piece of Tape a single penny, or any [These goods were Manchesters for the Schools which were sent in the Elizabeth] other Article and it had ever been discovered I should have been accused of fraud & speculation. Knowing the Persons I had to deal with I was not going to subject myself to groundless Suspicions; to Endless Explanations and continued Complaints— All you can say my Agent sold them, and I have told you the x 22, are we all liars and M^r M. the only true man]

Reason, but you cannot say, that either I or my Agent/

[No]

put a Farthing in our Pockets— I admit I sent under the Care of the Rev^d T. Kendall such Goods as he chouse [sic] to take, whose Prices were known— I conceived he was the proper Person to take Charge of them during the Voyage and to hand over the public Stores on his arrival to M^r Francis Hall the Storekeeper* — [Wrong. There were two distinct Invoices]

I admit also that the Shipping Expences, and the Ensurance [sic] amounting to about 6-per-cent were added to the different Articles which were for Sale to the workmen & Settlers in order to keep the Sum total of what the Goods cost correct— M^r Kendall put the Ensurance and Shipping Charges upon the different Articles with his own Hand, under my directions— I conceived this just— The Sum is not worth mentioning— Should the Committee in London think this an unjust Tax” they will remit it— You told me you thought it was just that all the

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

Labourers should pay the small additional Sum— but unjust that you should pay it— You receive £200 per annum, while the Carpenters receive but £60— I think [only 160— my son 40—]

it no disgrace either to me or to the Society to charge the actual amount of the original Cost paid in London, nor do I think I should be a faithful Agent if [I] omitted this Charge/

[This is grossly false and wrong for M^r Marsden kept teasing me about them in order to draw words from me. I told him it might be just or unjust with us to them I would]

You ask have you not endeavoured to defraud me? I answer no, never— The £55 was never [It was and I have M^r Marsden's letter] [f] charged to you in any of your Accounts, and you know well that it never was or intended and you cannot show it was/ [I can] and therefore I do not hesitate to say that your Insinuation is false and unfounded— I admit a small Bill drawn by M^r King was charged by you by M^r Campbell but not by me— The mistake was rectified the moment it was pointed out— you suffered no Loss— and you knew M^r Campbell was a man of such Honor and Integrity that he would immediately correct the Error— You ask, “have you not acted quite as bad by refusing to honour a just Bill which I have paid for Timber on Account of the Society.” I never refused to pay a just Bill— [* Wrong. The Bill is just and so proved by all the Committee at New Zealand.] I contend the Bill in Question was not just— I am not a little astonished that you should mention

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

such a disgraceful Buisness.— Shortly after you arrived in New Zealand it was determined you Mess^{rs} Hall & Kemp ~~shoule~~ should settle at Kiddee Kiddee. You wanted Timber to build your Houses with a considerable Quantity of Logs [which] were lying up on the Beach at Ranghee Hoo— On my inquiring to whom they belonged, Messrs Kendall Hall & King claimed them as their Property— I proposed to give them whatever they had given for them {This is all M^r King claims] in order to forward your Building at Kiddee Kiddee. Mess^{rs} Hall & Kendall agreed to my Proposal. Mess^{rs} Hall & Kendall agreed to my proposal. [M^r Kendall was paid in powder by M^r Marsden M^r Hall in Money.] M^r King presented a Bill and demanded to be paid in money. [And how very strange to refuse M^r King after paying M^r Hall] I told him I could not purchase the Timber and pay for it in money it would appear in my Accounts very strange to purchase Timber from the Settlers in money for building their own Houses with and I would not set such a Precedent [Alas! Then why pay M^r W^m Hall in money.] but that M^r King might have Payment in any Articles he wanted out. [f] You ask me if I have not charged your [unjustly] Son £19.14s. for victuals. I had many Reasons for wishing your Son to return with me to New South Wales soon after our arrival in New Zealand— Some of which I shall mention.— It gave me much concern to see such personal differences between you and your Son— I had never seen a Father provoke a Son to wrath so much as you did him, nor a Son so disobedient to a Father as he was to you— I was apprehensive that some very serious evils would arise from these differences

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

independent of [exceedingly exaggerated Mr M. like a drowning man, he will catch at a straw] the bad Effects produced upon the minds of the Heathens by your mutual Quarrels. — Your Son then talked of destroying himself [A complete lie] or of making his Escape as Mrs Butler can testify [No never] and she was very unhappy on his Account — I felt much for his distress — This was one Reason why I wished your Son to be moved for a time — — — You may remember that shortly after we landed at Ranghee Hoo, a very serious Quarrel happened between you and the Chief Motuee about a Pit saw — *[exagerated [sic] and false, see my journal for the truth] you suffered yourself to be overcome by the most violent passions, and for a mere trifle. — I was present. I expected Motuee would have given you a mortal blow every moment with his Maree, from your threatening Language towards him — At length I got you into Mr Hall's House, when I retired into the Bed Room — In a few moments I heard Mrs Butler scream aloud, that the natives were killing you — I hastened to the spot where [f] I found you had renewed your Quarrel with Motuee and Motuee was brandishing his Maree over your head^a [He never did Mr Marsden was not with me but Teeterree] after separating you a second time I returned to Mr Halls, where I found your Son in the Act of ladening a musket to shoot Matoee — I did not doubt but at that moment he intended to do so — I was alarmed at the Idea of a thoughtless youth, presuming to think of shooting a New Zealand Chief by which the Life of every European in the Settlement might have been sacrificed — ^(b) [It would have been well if many others

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

of much more importance had done the act] This very act made a deep impression upon my mind particularly when I contrasted your Conduct and his together [sic]— I did not think it was prudent for him to remain until you were more settled and better acquainted with the Character of the natives— As I was pressed by the Chiefs to take their Sons with me to Parramatta I thought he might be usefully employed in teaching them under my Eye, and Roof— I should treat him as one of my Family, and he would meet no improper Company at my Table— It was arranged between you and me, that he was to have a Salary of £40 per annum [This is false for I told Mr M that I would not pay any part of his food] and a Ration equal to what was issued to the People at New Zealand, but his wine spirits and other extras were to be paid out of his Salary— [This is false for I told Mr M that I would not pay any part of his food] I charged for his Board and Lodgings 12^s per week half to himself and half to the Society. He was treated in every Respect as I should treat my own Son, and enjoyed all the Comforts of my Table, and the best Society in the Colony. — [f] He must have been a considerable Expense to me more than what I charged when the Price of living in the Colony is considered.— I believe he would not have got such a lodging and Table for less than £2 per week— As you have refused to pay me the £19.14 for 15 months Lodging &c which is a just demand, I have no doubt but the Society will— [I should like to know what these are as soon as I can see Mr Marsden] I was also anxious that your Son should form some Friendship with the Chiefs Sons who would be under his

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

Care— I had some other Reasons for wishing your Son from N. Zealand which I need not mention— I have now replied to the principal Parft of your Letter of the 8th inst. You observe, "my very Heart aches while I put those important Questions." I hope I have relieved you of the Heart Ache and that you are now quite well— [I am not; but worse than ever because I know him guilty] I shall now make a few remarks upon your Letter on the 11th in which you wish to attach 'eternal disgrace' to me and all my Colleagues for not receiving you into their Houses— Some of my Colleagues are extremely poor but I believe they are willing to use Hospitality according to their Ability— I think you have not put it in their power to shew their willingness to receive you into their Houses— On your arrival you never reported yourself to me which you ought to have done. [I saw and shook hands with Mr Marsden the very first thing on the morning of my arrival.] I at first thought that was an intentional omission, and therefore, on my arrival at Sydney I requested the Rev^d R. Hill to accommodate you with a Room in his House; and a Seat at his Table when you remained in Sydney, and to shew you every attention as a minister of the established Church— [See my letter and observe second sentence] If yhou had been my Son I could not have done more for you— when I saw you for the first time in Sydney you appeared [f] as if you wished to avoid me— [How can this be? Mr M. avoided me and left me to get to Parramatta as I could— and then without Invitation] I also rfequested Mr Campbell to supply you with what money you might want and he told you in my Presence he would— you did not apply to me

Samuel Marsden to John Butler

for Lodgings if you had they would have been provided for you— you united yourself with Persons whose Society you approved of more than the Society of the established Clergy— no doubt you had your Reasons for doing so— and you pleased yourself— of all the Crimes that have been laid to my Charge, no one to my knowledge ever accused me before, of the want of Hospitality— you complain you were in great want of money. This could not be: you had only to ask and have— State things fairly and honestly— you pressed upon me to answer these Letters I have done so— Perhaps now you will be satisfied— I only regret the Loss of time as I might employ it much better— and have none to throw away in such differences. I think the day will come, and perhaps much sooner than you think, of, when you will see the Impropriety of writing these two Letters as there is nothing in them of that meekness and kindness of Heart which Our blessed Saviour hath taught us: and at the same time he hath also said, "It must need be that offence come, but woe to that man by whom the offence cometh." — If I have given offence I must bear the Judgment, and if you have you must bear it—

I am

Rev^d Sir

Yourf most obed^t

Humble Servant

Sam^l Marsden

Rev^d J. Butler—